Privacy literacy work at the frontier of intellectual freedom

Sarah Hartman-Caverly & Alexandria Chisholm
Penn State Berks | Reference & Instruction Librarians
ALA IFRT Intellectual Freedom Webinars
April 15, 2020
Today's Agenda

1. Why privacy literacy?
2. Penn State Berks Privacy Workshop Series
3. Privacy literacy scholarship
4. Possibilities in privacy literacy programming
Why Privacy Literacy?

- Shared interest in privacy literacy
- Neglected topic in IL instruction
- Opportunities:
  - FYS workshop series started Fall ‘17
  - Student Affairs partnership
- Scaffolded approach leveraging both curricular and cocurricular partnerships
Privacy literacy enables the exercise of privacy rights in the same way that textual literacy enables the exercise of speech rights (Keizer, 2012, p. 2)
Privacy literacy defined

A suite of knowledge, behaviors, and critical dispositions regarding the information constructs of selfhood, expressive activities, and relationships, privacy literacy is related to information literacy, and addresses many of the metaphysical and social dynamics of information (Hartman-Caverly & Chisholm, forthcoming *IFLA Journal*).
Identity
Intellect
Integrity
Intimacy
Interaction / Isolation
Privacy Workshop Series at Penn State Berks
Privacy Workshop Learning Outcomes

Focus on privacy in the present

Students will be able to:

1. recognize how their personal data and metadata are collected, along with the potential implications of such data collection
2. assess how their data is shared and make informed, intentional choices to safeguard their privacy
3. identify privacy issues facing our society
4. describe the positive case for privacy as a human right fundamental to individual well-being

Privacy Workshop Guide: https://guides.libraries.psu.edu/berks/privacy
Three types of data:

1. **Consciously given data** - your name, email, date of birth.
   - ACTIVITY = reflection stations

2. **Automatically monitored data (a.k.a. metadata)** - where you log in from, what time you do it, where else you visit on the web.
   - ACTIVITY = explore web browsers & ad profiles

3. **Modeled data** - predicted from other data, such as your quantified attractiveness or trustworthiness.
   - ACTIVITY = case studies

Focus on privacy in the future

Students will be able to:

1. recognize that online behavior is persistent and there is no guarantee that it will remain private (despite privacy settings)
2. anticipate how perceptions of their online behavior can impact their personal and professional opportunities and make informed, intentional decisions regarding their activity
3. align their online activity within the context of their future profession
4. model constructive online behaviors as student leaders and future professionals

Digital Leadership Workshop Guide: https://guides.libraries.psu.edu/berks/DigitalLeadership
Find a link relevant to your career goals/major on the workshop guide: https://guides.libraries.psu.edu/berks/Digital Leadership

Explore the social media guidelines & policies of your profession/field.

What surprised you?

How do your current behaviors & actions on social media hold up in comparison?

What will you continue? What will you alter/change?
Digital Shred Workshop Learning Outcomes

Focus on privacy in the past

Students will be able to:

1. reflect on and describe their digital privacy priorities in order to articulate the benefits and risks of their digital dossier
2. apply a growth mindset to critically examine their current data exhaust // digital footprint and recognize when change is needed
3. develop a Personal Data Integrity Plan that makes routine the process of auditing and updating their digital dossier in alignment with their privacy values
4. describe “digital shred” and its importance

Digital Shred Workshop Guide: https://guides.libraries.psu.edu/berks/DigitalShred
Developed with Alexandrea Glenn, reference & instruction librarian, Susquehanna University
## Personal Data Integrity Plan

Plan ahead and make a routine process of auditing & updating your digital dossier / online presence.

[https://guides.libraries.psu.edu/berks/DigitalShred](https://guides.libraries.psu.edu/berks/DigitalShred)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Account / Product / App</th>
<th>Priority / risk level</th>
<th>Audit Frequency</th>
<th>Next Step Resources</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Smartphone</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circle ones</td>
<td>High</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iPhone</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Android</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Web Browser</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circle ones</td>
<td>High</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firefox</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chrome</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>High</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instagram</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twitter</td>
<td>High</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Snapchat</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>High</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>High</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[https://sites.psu.edu/digitals shred/category/toolkits/smartphone/](https://sites.psu.edu/digitalshred/category/toolkits/smartphone/)

[https://sites.psu.edu/digitals shred/category/toolkits/web-browse rs/](https://sites.psu.edu/digitalshred/category/toolkits/web-browsers/)

[https://sites.psu.edu/digitalshred/category/toolkits/social/](https://sites.psu.edu/digitalshred/category/toolkits/social/)
Digital Wellness Workshop Learning Outcomes

Focus on privacy across the lifespan - bringing together the past, present, & future by finding a balance of technology & wellness

Students will be able to:

1. evaluate & outline their digital wellness priorities
2. recognize that their relationship with technology can have real world impact on their personal well being, including relationships, mental health, & professional aspirations
3. align their online activity & habits within the context of their wellness goals
4. model constructive online and offline wellness behaviors as individuals, student leaders, and future professionals

Digital Wellness Workshop Guide:  http://guides.libraries.psu.edu/Berks/DigitalWellness
Privacy Literacy Scholarship
1. Is teaching privacy literacy [academic] librarians’ responsibility?
2. Are [academic] librarians teaching privacy literacy?
3. Do students care about privacy?
4. ....Now what?
Is teaching privacy literacy librarians’ responsibility?
Table 1: Comparison of Privacy Literacy Framework and Critical Thinking Definitions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rotman’s Privacy Literacy Framework</th>
<th>Critical Thinking Definitions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understanding how personal information is used online.</td>
<td>“Conscious awareness about one’s thought processes with insight, clarity and effectiveness as goals.” (Robinson, 2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognizing the various places personal information may be shared online.</td>
<td>“Reasonable and reflective thinking focused on deciding what to believe or do.” (Ennis, 1987)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Realizing the consequence of sharing personal information online.</td>
<td>N/A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluating the risks and benefits of sharing personal information online.</td>
<td>“The careful examination of an issue in order to reach a reasoned judgment.” (Bailin &amp; Battersby, 2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deciding when to share personal information online.</td>
<td>“Attempts to arrive at a decision or judgment only after honestly evaluating alternatives with respect to available evidence and arguments.” (Hatcher &amp; Spender, 2006)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Library Bill of Rights

All people, regardless of origin, age, background, or views, possess a right to privacy and confidentiality in their library use. Libraries should advocate for, educate about, and protect people’s privacy, safeguarding all library use data, including personally identifiable information.

Article VII, amended January 29, 2019
ACRL Framework for Information Literacy

Information has Value

Knowledge Practices

Learners who are developing their information literate abilities:

- understand how the commodification of their personal information and online interactions affects the information they receive and the information they produce or disseminate online;
- make informed choices regarding their online actions in full awareness of issues related to privacy and the commodification of personal information.

Are librarians teaching privacy literacy?
“While **over 75%** of the respondents feel that libraries should play a role in educating the general public about privacy issues... **only 13%** indicate that their library has hosted or organized information sessions, lectures, or other public events related to privacy and surveillance over the past five years.”


“While many respondents had attended professional development events related to privacy, **55%**, not many worked at a library that hosted these opportunities for patrons, **19%**.”

### Basis for Privacy Literacy in Instruction by Response Count

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core values of librarianship; professional code of ethics</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACRL Framework (Information has Value)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Student interest</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject faculty request / collaboration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information literacy program outcome</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not addressed by other co-/curricular units</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject-based learning outcome (ex. HIPAA in health science)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Bar chart showing response count for various factors related to privacy literacy instruction.](chart_url)
What does PRIVACY mean to you?

- Not allowing people to know personal information they don't want to share.
- Protecting ourselves from people taking our info.
- Having some sort of protective boundary over personal space, keeping info.
- Not having people know really personal info.
- Keeping personal stuff secret.
- Confidentiality.
- Having the ability to determine which personal info is shared.

The ability to know who knows what about you.

Respect for others, name it me, personal space.
This workshop taught me...

- Something new about how my personal data can have real-world impact
- Strategies I can use to evaluate my preferences & manage my personal data
- A new way to think about privacy
- Something I’d want to share with friends or family

Legend:
- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree
Top takeaway, comments, or suggestions
35 total responses

you are always tracked
It was great and people are always watching you

technology sucks
They can track your movements within the tab of the website. Like where you move and where you click.

People collect more about me online than I thought, and use the information in different ways than I thought.
Web browsers can get info on the users behavior
free flash drive
How to better protect ourselves
Make sure you check your privacy settings often to make sure you are staying safe.

Was interesting to see what other people thought about this and some of the things they thought were being collected and or used
Browsers collect information without you even knowing. They can even sell it to other companies if you give them permission without even realizing it. I mean, no one reads the terms and conditions but maybe we should start.

I really appreciated the resources provided at the end that help interpret the legal jargon that comes with privacy protection.

Very interesting workshop and really learned a lot about how little privacy we actually have
They're watching!
secure my privacy

I find the information helpful. In fact, I have several home devices like "Alexa" and "Google Home", and never knew they could record the things we say.

The Data Privacy Check-List that I should look towards whenever I get an app or make a profile can be very useful.

It's good to know I'm not the only one who feels like I'm getting stalked, or that apps are being very creepy.

The information that is shared about me to different websites and social media sites that I use. Where I am, and personal interests as well. I also learned how I am able to prevent my information being leaked.

I enjoyed how you kept me on my feet and interested

great way to interact with us
Always block the camera

This frightens me
privacy is for anarchists

I didn't know you can track your advertisement "preferences"

Privacy in the modern world is not what I thought it was.

It is scary how much information is taken w/o permission
...NOW WHAT?

When intrigue is gone, people have no mystery - what then becomes private? Is there a new level of privacy?
Factors Influencing Lack of Delivery or Dissatisfaction with Privacy Literacy Instruction by Response Count

- I do not have enough instructional time to address privacy
- Privacy is not a priority learning outcome for IL sessions
- Lack of subject faculty support
- I do not have the expertise to teach about privacy
- I do not have time to develop privacy learning activities...
- Lack of library administration support
- Other
- I don't know
- Lack of student interest
- Privacy literacy falls outside of information literacy
- Another campus department teaches about privacy
Let’s do what we do best!

- Cultivate professional self-efficacy
- Low-hanging fruit
  - Collections
  - Privacy topics as search demos
  - Topic guide
  - Programs (May - Choose Privacy Week)
- Share privacy literacy OERs
  - ACRL Sandbox: digital privacy
  - Project CORA: privacy
- Scholarly & professional communication

Privacy Programming Development
Tips for Developing Privacy Literacy Programming

- Holistic approach
  - Privacy is a value system before it is a technology (Hartman-Caverly & Chisholm, forthcoming *IFLA Journal*)
- Control paradox (Brandimarte, Acquisti, & Loewenstein, 2012)
  - Focus on context over method - the *why* not the *how*
- Listen & learn
  - Participants bring their own experiences, values, & knowledge
Create your own privacy program!

Digital Shred Privacy Literacy Toolkit: sites.psu.edu/digitalshred

Share:
- ACRL Sandbox: digital privacy
- Project CORA: privacy
Next Steps in Privacy Literacy

1. **Programming**: develop, share, repeat
2. **Study** (forthcoming, *IFLA Journal*): Privacy literacy instruction practices in academic libraries: Past, present and possibilities
3. **Qualitative study**: follow-up study on privacy literacy

Student responses from Privacy Workshop
Call for Participation!

Interested in participating in our follow-up qualitative study? Are you...

1. An academic librarian?
2. With teaching / instruction duties?
3. Already teaching privacy literacy topics?

If you answered ‘yes’ to all three questions, contact us!

Alex Chisholm, aec67@psu.edu
Sarah Hartman-Caverly, smh767@psu.edu
How might you integrate privacy literacy into your instruction/work?
Questions?

Sarah Hartman-Caverly
smh767@psu.edu

Alex Chisholm
aec67@psu.edu

Digital Shred Privacy Literacy Toolkit:
https://sites.psu.edu/digitalshred/

Connect! @Digital_Shred